



# City of Dayton

## Landmark Commission

### Meeting Case Record June 15, 2023

**1. Replacement of partial slate roof for approval - Case # PLN2023-00199 – 54 Perrine Street** – A Major modification to replace the partial slate and asphalt roof with a metal roof along with upgraded 6” gutters and downspouts.

**Applicant:** Mike Proffitt  
54 Perrine St  
Dayton, OH 45402

**Owner:** Mike Proffitt  
54 Perrine St  
Dayton, OH 45402

**Priority Land Use Board:** Downtown  
**Historic District:** South Park  
**Decision:** Continued

**Planning District:** South Park

---

#### Case Presentation

Ms. Hornbeak presented the case. The request is to replace an existing partial slate roof, which has reached the end of its effective lifespan. The replacement roof proposed is a standing seam metal roof. Product information was submitted.

Mike Proffitt, the owner and applicant, was present to answer any questions. Mr. Proffitt explained that he was interested in installing a metal replacement roof due to its durability and increased lifespan over a more traditional asphalt shingle roof.

#### Public Comments

No public comments.

#### Board Discussion

The Board discussed the roof replacement. Ms. Sebald and Ms. McNicholl noted that the profile of the proposed metal roof, which is the “Performance Panel” roof, differs from a traditional standing seam metal roof. The traditional standing seam metal roof, it was noted, would be more historically and aesthetically appropriate. Photographs from the product website were brought up for reference but were ultimately too low-resolution to make an accurate determination as to what the finished product would look like.

The Landmark Commission was agreeable to installing a metal replacement roof but requested more information on the proposed product. Specifically, they requested photographs showing what the installed, finished product looked like or, if possible, a sample of the product. Mr. Holley suggested getting cost estimates for other styles of roof. Additionally, the Commission wanted to know if decorative finials on the existing roof could be retained and reinstalled on the new roof, which would be a requirement of any new roof.

#### Board Action

A motion was made by Ms. Sebald and seconded by Mr. Johnson to continue **Case # PLN2023-00199 – 54 Perrine Street.**

Mr. Gow	Absent	Ms. McNicholl	Yes
Mr. Heckman	Absent	Ms. Sebald	Yes
Mr. Johnson	Yes	Mr. Holley	Yes
Ms. Maragano	Absent		



# City of Dayton

## Landmark Commission

Page 2

### Meeting Case Record

June 15, 2023

Approved by Landmark Commission (4 in favor, 0 opposed)  
Elizabeth Dakin, Secretary, Landmark Commission



# City of Dayton

## Landmark Commission

### Meeting Case Record June 15, 2023

**2. Installation of new business signage for approval - Case # PLN2023-00200 – 15 W Fourth Street – Kuhn’s Building** - A Major modification to install new business signage at 15 W Fourth Street, consisting of a vertically oriented projecting sign and a horizontally oriented wall mounted sign.

**Applicant:** KAP Signs  
Dave Williams  
7564 Webster St  
Dayton, OH 45414

**Owner:** Dayton Arcade Partners LLC  
2400 Boston St, Ste 404  
Baltimore, MD 21224

**Priority Land Use Board:** Downtown

**Planning District:** Downtown

**Historic District:** N/A

**Decision:** Approved as Submitted

#### Case Presentation

Ms. Hornbeak presented the case. The request is to install new business signage for WYSO Public Radio. Site photographs were submitted. Specifications of the proposed signage submitted by the applicant were presented.

Dave Williams, representing KAP Signs, the applicant, was present to answer any questions. He confirmed which parts of the sign would be illuminated, and how the signs would be attached to the building.

#### Public Comments

No public comments.

#### Board Discussion

The Board discussed the signage. Overall, they found the proposal to be acceptable, given the scale and location of the building. The Commission commented that the proposed signage seemed “fun”.

#### Board Action

A motion was made by Ms. Sebald and seconded by Mr. Johnson to approve as submitted **Case # PLN2023-00200 – 15 W Fourth Street.**

Mr. Gow	Absent	Ms. McNicholl	Yes
Mr. Heckman	Absent	Ms. Sebald	Yes
Mr. Johnson	Yes	Mr. Holley	Yes
Ms. Maragano	Absent		

Approved by Landmark Commission (4 in favor, 0 opposed)  
Elizabeth Dakin, Secretary, Landmark Commission



# City of Dayton

## Landmark Commission

### Meeting Case Record

June 15, 2023

**3. Modification of existing front porch for approval - Case # PLN2023-00201 – 4 Yale Avenue** – A Major modification of existing front porches at 4 Yale Avenue, with submitted plans and elevations. Different plans for a rebuild of collapsed porch was approved in 2018. Modifications based on input from the Landmark Commission (Concept Review - PLN2023-00076).

**Applicant:** The Architectural Group  
Richard E Holmes  
135 N Main St  
Dayton, OH 45402

**Owner:** Eli Rashaed  
4900 Fredrick Pike  
Dayton, OH 45414

**Priority Land Use Board:** North Central

**Planning District:** Old Dayton View

**Historic District:** Dayton View

**Decision:** Continued

---

#### Case Presentation

Ms. Hornbeak presented the case. The request is for modifications to the existing front porch, in order to better align with proposal approved in 2018 and receive approval from the Landmark Commission. Proposal had been previously discussed by the Landmark Commission. Condition photographs were submitted. Information on the previously existing porch and previously approved reconstruction plans were submitted. Architectural drawings were presented.

Richard Holmes, the applicant, was present to speak about the project and answer any questions.

#### Public Comments

There were no public comments.

#### Board Discussion

The Landmark Commission discussed the new porch modifications. The Board noted that the use of fiberglass columns would be acceptable and is something they have allowed in the past. Overall, the Board acknowledged that the proposal submitted was better than the previous submission but noted that some issues still needed to be addressed.

Ms. Sebald and Ms. McNicholl noted that the top of the column was not aligned with the balcony decks, and that it looked strange. The suggestion was made to either buildout the balcony deck more to cover the top of the column, or to add a squared capital at the top of the column, as a transition piece, which would be flashed to protect from water infiltration. It was also noted that tapered columns could be used, which might affect relationship between the top of the columns and the balconies.

Additionally, the Landmark Commission thought that the existing railings needed to be addressed. The top and bottom rail should be “beefier”, or taller and more visually prominent (at least 2 ½”). A curved top rail is usually the appropriate detail on a historic porch. Mr. Holley also noted that the existing spindles are quite thin, and look like interior stair rail spindles, instead of a thicker exterior porch spindle. Ms. Sebald suggested that the top rail dead end into the corner railing posts, which should be taller than the interior posts.

#### Board Action



# City of Dayton

## Landmark Commission

### Meeting Case Record June 15, 2023

A motion was made by Mr. Johnson and seconded by Ms. Sebald to continue **Case # PLN2023-00151 –4 Yale Avenue.**

Mr. Gow	Absent	Ms. McNicholl	Yes
Mr. Heckman	Absent	Ms. Sebald	Yes
Mr. Johnson	Yes	Mr. Holley	Yes
Ms. Maragano	Absent		

Converted to Concept Review by Landmark Commission (4 in favor, 0 opposed)  
Elizabeth Dakin, Secretary, Landmark Commission