



City of Dayton

Landmark Commission

Meeting Case Record May 25, 2023

1. Construction of rear addition for approval - Case # PLN2023-00157 – 1625 E Fifth Street
– A Major modification for the construction a new 375 sq. ft. addition to the rear of the existing home. Proposed addition will match existing structure in terms of size, roof pitch, and foundation height.

Applicant: Matthew Kelly
105 High St
Dayton, OH 45403

Owner: Matthew Kelly
105 High St
Dayton, OH 45403

Priority Land Use Board: Northeast

Planning District: Historic Inner East

Historic District: St. Anne’s Hill

Decision: Approved with Modifications

Case Presentation

Ms. Hornbeak presented the case. The request is to construct an addition one the rear of the existing home. Proposal had been previously discussed by the Landmark Commission. Materials submitted by the applicant were presented. Architectural elevations were presented.

Matthew Kelly, the owner and applicant, was present to answer any questions. Mr. Kelly stated that he would be fine with using fiber cement siding with a 4” reveal, instead of 5”, which was state on the submitted elevations.

Public Comments

No public comments.

Board Discussion

The Board discussed the addition. They determined that, with the applicant agreeing to install siding with a 4” reveal, every issue from the previous concept review had been addressed and resolved.

Board Action

A motion was made by Mr. Heckman and seconded by Mr. Johnson to approve as modified **Case # PLN2023-00157 – 1625 E Fifth Street** Modifications include:

1. The fiber cement siding on the new addition will have a 4” reveal.

Mr. Gow	Absent	Ms. McNicholl	Absent
Mr. Heckman	Yes	Ms. Sebald	Yes
Mr. Johnson	Yes	Mr. Holley	Yes
Ms. Maragano	Absent		

Approved by Landmark Commission (4 in favor, 0 opposed)
Elizabeth Dakin, Secretary, Landmark Commission



City of Dayton

Landmark Commission

Meeting Case Record

May 25, 2023

2. Modification of door and window openings, and installaiton of new storefront for approval - Case # PLN2023-00158 – 1153-1157 W Third Street – A Major modification for the modification door and window openings on the sides and rear of the building, and to install a new storefront at the front of the building

Applicant: Greater Dayton Construction, Ltd.
John Popelar
4197 Research Blvd.
Beavercreek, OH 45430

Owner: Wright Dunbar REH LLC.
115 W Central
Springboro, OH 45066

Priority Land Use Board: West

Planning District: Wolf Creek

Historic District: Wright-Dunbar

Decision: Approved with Recommendations

Case Presentation

Ms. Hornbeak presented the case. The request is to modify existing door and window openings on the rear of the building, infill windows on the sides of the building, and to install a new aluminum storefront system at the existing storefront. Construction documents were submitted.

John Popelar, representing Greater Dayton Construction Ltd., the applicant, was present to answer any questions. Mr. Popelar explained the reasoning behind the changes requested at the rear elevation and confirmed that the new aluminum storefront would match proportionally with the existing storefront. He also discussed ideas for the modification of an existing infill wall, located to the left side of the front façade.

Public Comments

No public comments.

Board Discussion

The Board discussed the modifications. Ms. Sebald noted that if the windows on the side of the building are infilled, they likely could not later be restored, due to current fire and building codes. Ms. Sebald also discussed with Mr. Popelar ideas for the treatment of the infill wall on the left side of the existing façade.

Board Action

A motion was made by Ms. Sebald and seconded by Mr. Heckman to approve with recommendations **Case # PLN2023-00158 – 1153-1157 W Third Street**. Recommendations include:

1. The infilled wall between the structures on the western side of the building should be considered, and either inset or treated with similar fiber cement panels. Details on this wall were not submitted at the meeting, and should be submitted to the Historic Preservation Officer for final approval

Mr. Gow	Absent	Ms. McNicholl	Absent
Mr. Heckman	Yes	Ms. Sebald	Yes



City of Dayton

Landmark Commission

Meeting Case Record May 25, 2023

Mr. Johnson
Ms. Maragano

Yes
Absent

Mr. Holley

Yes

Approved by Landmark Commission (4 in favor, 0 opposed)
Elizabeth Dakin, Secretary, Landmark Commission



City of Dayton

Landmark Commission

Meeting Case Record

May 25, 2023

3. Modification of doors, windows, removal of chimney, and replacement of column for approval - Case # PLN2023-00151 – 1944 E Fourth Street – A MAJOR Certificate of Appropriateness to approve previously modified windows, modify the front and rear doors as well as windows on the front of the house. Additional windows as well as a box bay window is proposed on the west elevation. A non-original iron column is also proposed to be replaced with a square column and the rear chimney is proposed to be removed.

Applicant: Lora Sebald
1705 E 4th St
Dayton, OH 45403

Owner: John & Amy Siu
10238 Morgan Grey Ct
Dayton, OH 45458

Priority Land Use Board: Northeast

Planning District: Historic Inner East

Historic District: Huffman

Decision: Converted to Concept Review

Case Presentation

Elizabeth Dakin presented the case. She described the request and staff report in a presentation that included images of the existing property. The previous owners had started work on the home replacing windows without a COA and the new owners had done additional work without a COA such that a stop work order had been issued in December 2022.

Lora Sebald, the applicant, was present to speak about the project and answer any questions. Ms. Sebald described each part of the project and stated that the new owners thought they were buying a home with new windows to find out that they had not been permitted. She explained further that the Sanborn maps show that there were additional homes between this one and where the school had been and that no windows would have been on the west elevation because of the proximity of the next house. However, since these homes had been demolished due to the school expansion, it was appropriate to add additional windows as there might have been if it had originally fronted an alley.

Public Comments

There were no public comments.

Board Discussion

The Landmark Commission discussed the concept. Mr. Holley asked Ms. Sebald if she was returning it to the original sizes and placements of the windows. Ms. Sebald explained that the proposed replacement windows are more like the original ones. Mr. Heckman asked if the house was still gutted on the interior and Ms. Sebald confirmed that it was. Mr. Holley asked if the siding that was missing was going to be replaced with siding that is 2” to match the existing siding and Ms. Sebald confirmed that it will. Mr. Holley stated that in his neighborhood it wasn’t common to see windows facing an alleyway and Ms. Sebald said it was very common in these neighborhoods because the lots are small. Mr. Heckman and Mr. Holley agreed that they understood the rationale behind the western elevation. Mr. Holley asked if the porch had been filled in to create the mini-foyer and Ms. Sebald confirmed that it had. Ms. Sebald asked Which western elevation the LMC preferred and they determined that “exhibit J” looked better. The



City of Dayton

Landmark Commission

Meeting Case Record May 25, 2023

property owner, agreed. Mr. Holley also suggested that the window in the foyer be a single pane fixed window. Ms. Sebald checked with the owner and they were accepting of the suggestion.

Board Action

A motion was made by Ms. Sebald and seconded by Mr. Heckman to convert **Case # PLN2023-00151 –1944 E Fourth Street** to a concept review because there was not a quorum to be able to make a decision on the case.

Mr. Gow	Absent	Ms. McNicholl	Absent
Mr. Heckman	Yes	Ms. Sebald	Recused
Mr. Johnson	Yes	Mr. Holley	Yes
Ms. Maragano	Absent		

Converted to Concept Review by Landmark Commission (3 in favor, 0 opposed)
Elizabeth Dakin, Secretary, Landmark Commission