1. PLN2020-00077 – Zoning Map Amendment -- Establish Planned Development PD-178 for 721 Miami Chapel Street and Rezone All Property Within the Boundaries of the Planned Development from MR-5 Mature Single-Family to T Transitional

Applicant: Mr. Kim Patton
Elevar Design Group
555 Carr Street
Cincinnati, OH 45203

Priority Land Use Board: West
Planning District: Edgemont

Decision: Recommended Approval

Staff Comments

Tony Kroeger presented the staff report. He said staff believed the determinations and findings could be made and recommended approval. A work session on this project was held on March 10, 2020. To recap, this is a proposed redevelopment of the Whittier School site for a Five Rivers Health Center at 721 Miami Chapel Street within the Edgemont Planning District. A Planned Development is proposed, which will change the zoning from MR-5 Mature Single-family Residential to T Transitional with a PD overlay. The Health Center will serve the Dayton region, and the site was chosen based on its proximity to residents who will benefit from the Health Center, accessibility from I-75 and SR-35, lot size and price.

The site is 4.4245-acres of vacant land. Although it consists of mostly grass, the site will need some additional prep work due to the presence of the previous school structure. Upon completion of site borings, it was determined that the foundation and basement of the school is buried underground. Excavation of the structure, grading and extra-deep footing with be required for the new structure construction.

The site is currently zoned MR-5, which doesn’t allow for medical offices. The architects have met with planning and zoning staff to determine the path forward. It was determined that a planned development and change of the underlying zoning to Transitional would best suit the needs of the medical use. A site nearby was recently rezoned to Transitional for medical uses and amending the zoning on this site will allow for consistent zoning within the area. Although the Transitional district allows for medical office, there are still some aspects of the design and proposed use that do not comply with the proposed zoning district. Thus, a planned development will also allow the redevelopment of the site to be flexible and in line with the goals of Five Rivers Health Centers.

The flexibility of a planned development will allow for an increased front building setback, an increase in allowable height and scale, use of a drive-thru for a proposed pharmacy, and parking in the front yard. Planning, zoning, and CityWide have been in discussions with the Elevar Group, the architecture firm responsible for the design. Elevar has submitted the current plan based on feedback from the City in terms of site design and Five Rivers Health Centers need for specific interior layout and parking requirements. Also, the design of the building will follow sustainability practices and be LEED certified.

The facility will include medical offices for women’s health, family health and dentistry, as well as a pharmacy and administration. A portion of the second floor will be a 10,000-sf shell space for future expansion. The submitted site plan includes a building footprint of 38,000-sf for two-stories and an 11,000-sf third story set on the back half to the building to visually lessen the height of the building from the street. The proposed building will total 85,000-sf. Each floor is designed at 14-ft, with a building height around 45-ft total.
The building’s entrance is situated along Miami Chapel Road and includes a prominent portico and vehicular drop-off area. Also, the proposed pedestrian access from the street mimics that of the previous school, with a separated, straight, tree-lined walk from the street. The site holds 225 parking spaces and has been laid out to allow for patient parking nearest to the entrance. Parking at the back will be for employees and ambulances/shuttles for incarcerated patients.

Ample setbacks are proposed along Miami Chapel and Campbell allowing for both street trees and landscaped bio swales. Also, at the intersection, a large 9,000-sf detention area will provide attractive green space for passersby. Three new curb cuts will be added to the site, two off of Campbell, and one on Miami Chapel. The northern-most curb-cut will ease the circulation of the proposed pharmacy drive-thru, as users can enter and exit there without circling the entire site.

The design of the site has examined a number of possible layouts and the submitted layout has been determined to best meet the needs of Five Rivers Health Centers and also take the City’s zoning code requirements into consideration.

**Public Hearing Comments**
The applicants, Kimberly Patton, Elevar Design Group, 555 Carr Street, Cincinnati, OH and Gina McFarlane-El, CEO, Five Rivers Health Centers, 2261 Philadelphia Drive, Dayton, OH, described the project and answered questions from the Plan Board.

**Board Discussion**
The Plan Board discussed the project. Ms. Pegues asked if staff from the Philadelphia Drive location will be moved to this new location. Ms. McFarlane-El said some staff will be moved but many will remain on Philadelphia Drive. Mr. Payne asked about the status of additional parking that is needed north of the location. Ms. McFarlane-El said they are waiting to hear back from the landlord of the additional property they wish to use for parking. Mr. Kroeger noted that the project meets Zoning Code parking requirements; no parking variance is needed for the project. Mr. Patton said Five Rivers is looking to add parking beyond what the Zoning Code requires. Ms. Pegues asked if meeting space will be provided in the building; Ms. McFarlane-El said each floor contains meeting space. Mr. Scott noted that the landscape plan does not include all needed landscaping. Staff, the applicants, and Plan Board members agreed that a sentence will be added to the PD requirements stating that “Vegetation between the proposed parking lot and Miami Chapel Road shall be installed and densely planted to soften the visual impact of the parking lot and obstruct the impact of automobile headlights.”

**Board Action**
A motion was made by Mr. Payne, seconded by Mr. Sauer and carried to recommend City Commission approval of Case PLN2020-00077 based on the Plan Board’s ability to make the determinations specified in R.C.G.O. Section 150.125.7 as outlined in the staff report. A sentence will be added to the Planned Development requirements stating that “Vegetation between the proposed parking lot and Miami Chapel Road shall be installed and densely planted to soften the visual impact of the parking lot and obstruct the impact of automobile headlights.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ms. Beverly Pendergast</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Mr. Paul Bradley</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Richard Wright</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td>Mr. Matt Sauer</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Geraldine Pegues</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Mr. Greg Scott</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Jeff Payne</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on May 12, 2020.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board
2. PLN2020-00049 – Development Plan Review and Approval – Hope Center at 1800 Harvard Boulevard on the Omega Campus

Applicant: Mr. Ken Conaway for Omega Baptist Church
Ken Conaway, LLC
110 Harbour Drive
Springboro, OH 45066

Priority Land Use Board: North Central
Planning District: Dayton View Triangle

Decision: Determined March 10, 2020 Conditions Met; Approved Revised Development Plan with Conditions

Staff Comments
Jeff Green presented the staff report and recommended approval of the plan with conditions. Omega Baptist Church proposes to construct a 28,200 square foot Community Center named the Hope Center at its campus at 1800 Harvard Boulevard. Planned Development PD-160 which governs the campus requires the Plan Board to approve a Development Plan prior to any new construction of a principal building. Mr. Green recapped the proposal and described changes to the plan that were requested by the Plan Board at its March 10, 2020 meeting.

Per the March 10, 2020 Plan Board meeting, the Board requested that the applicant look into updating the following items in regards to building design:

1) Placing brick veneer on the 2nd floor (instead of metal panels)
2) Windows should reflect surrounding structures

Per the applicant, the building design has been modified to the greatest extent giving budgetary and time constraints. These modifications include:

- Contemporary colorization presented in the original renderings has changed to more closely match the chapel and senior lofts such as a more traditional “red” brick coloring, stone that matches typical older stonework, and softening the exterior finish system.
- Peaked roof has been accented to increase its prominence.
- Window Mullions were modified to draw attention to vertical rather than horizontal lines.

Per letters received from both the structural engineer and project architect, the cost to apply brick veneer (and replace the metal panels) would average out to roughly $414,000 in redesign fees, material, and labor. The structural engineer sees adding brick veneer as “major structural cost components” to the overall design of the building.

In conclusion, and based off the updated documents which were submitted, the building’s design largely keeps its contemporary design and scaling. However, as noted above, the requested changes to the building (per the engineer and architect) would add heavy costs to the project and require additional time. The applicant states that such a redesign of the building would be unfeasible due to budgetary and critical time constraints. Given the specifications that outline the cost for a redesign of the structure, and the adjustments the applicant has been able to take to further have the building reflect the existing chapel and
senior lofts, staff feels that these changes are welcome and would meet the minimum requirements of PD-160.

**Traffic and Pedestrian Access:**

Per the plans submitted, the Hope Center will have two primary vehicular points of access: one from Harvard Boulevard with the other primary access being the circular drive located in the center of the campus and providing an access off of Cornell Drive. A secondary access point will connect the Hope Center via the Senior Lofts.

The perimeter walking path is to be retained under PD-160, and repaired as needed. As per the conditions for approval at the March 10, 2020 Plan Board meeting, the sidewalk now connects to the existing walking path along the perimeter of the campus. As such, the traffic and pedestrian access elements meet the minimum requirements of the PD.

**Off-Street Parking:**

Per the plans submitted, the proposed parking configuration has been altered from the previously approved plans. Such a change, per PD-160, is considered minor in nature and may be authorized in concurrence by the Zoning Director and Zoning Administrator.

Per the submitted plans, 100 parking spaces are proposed. Under the requirements of PD-160, four (4) parking spaces are required for each 1,000 square feet of floor area. Based upon that ratio, the proposed 28,200 square foot building would require a total of 112 parking spaces be provided.

Per the Zoning Administrator section 150.700.3(A) [Floor Area as Unit of Measure], required parking for uses in which “floor area” is unit of measure—may be reduced (up to 20% of total floor area)—for areas designated as storage, packaging or kitchen areas. Discussions with the project architect confirm the applicability of parking reduction factor. As such, the amount of parking spaces being proposed is compliant with PD-160.

Per the updated parking plan submitted, eight parking spots have been removed and are proposed to be replaced by eight parking spots in the existing adjacent parking lot next to the chapel. This was done to comply with the required 20’ setback as per the PD requirements. The proposed updated parking plan would therefor meet minimum setback requirements.

Per PD-160, one evergreen shrub shall be provided along the perimeter of a parking lot for each five (5) linear feet. The landscaping plan submitted exceeds the PD requirement and shows 103 shrubs and 32 trees being planted would be planted around the perimeter of the proposed parking lot and building. As such, the off-street parking landscaping requirements would be met as stated in the PD requirements.

It should be noted that there is a tree on the western side of the proposed entrance/exit that is in close proximity to an existing street light. After speaking with the applicant, they agreed to adjust (as necessary) with the help of their landscape designer so there is no a negative effect on the existing street light.

**Off-Street Bicycle Parking Regulations:**

Per the submitted bicycle parking plans, an 11-bike parking rack is proposed to be placed on along the south elevation of the building. The PD requires a minimum of 10 bicycle parking spots be provided per principal building. This would meet the requirements as outlined in the PD.
**Landscaping along Public Right-of-Way (and tree removal):**

Per the plans (and letter) regarding tree removal submitted, 13 trees will be removed. As shown on the plans, these trees are largely in the footprint or influence of the building and parking lot. It should be noted, that nearly all of these trees have already been removed. Per the applicant, this was due to Indiana Bat Nesting Protection Season beginning earlier this month which could have significantly pushed back construction.

PD-160 requires 1 (one) deciduous street tree for every thirty (30) linear feet. PD-160 would require the lost plantings to be replaced with new deciduous trees. A number of street trees already exist along the street, with two new ones being planted at the entrance of the development per the landscaping plan. Furthermore, per the letter provided that details the demolition of the trees, 32 new trees are proposed to be planted as screening. As such, the proposed plan seems to meet the requirements of PD-160.

**Signage:**

Per PD-160, signs shall adhere to the regulations within the Mature Commercial District sign schedule under R.C.G.O. 150.900.7. Per the elevations submitted, a wall sign will be placed on the south building elevation, though no plan has been submitted noting specific sign details. Separate sign permits are required for any permitted sign placement. Per the applicants submittal, the sign package will be submitted at a future date and comply with all city sign codes.

**Waste Receptacles:**

PD-160 allows waste receptacles to be placed in the front, side, or rear yard so long as it is located at least 30 feet from the public right-of-way. Per the plan submitted, the dumpster is proposed to be roughly 50’ from the public-right-of-way located in front of the principal building. Per the plans submitted, a CMU dumpster enclosure compatible with the base material of the Hope Center will be utilized. The plan also shows a vegetative barrier be placed around the dumpster to further screen the site. As such, the proposed plan seems to meet the requirements of PD-160.

**Lighting:**

Per PD-160, exterior lighting shall comply with 150.420.3 (Exterior lighting standards). Per the plans submitted, a lighting site plan has been provided which shows numerous light poles (Cimarron CL1) to illuminate the proposed parking lot in addition to LED Sconce down-lighting for placement on the Hope Center. All lighting will be cut-off fixtures. The plans show a total height of 20’ for the light poles. As such, the minimum requirements of PD-160 will be met.

Staff recommends **approval** of the proposed site plan, if the Plan Board is comfortable with the color scheme, with the following conditions:

1. Sign specifications shall be submitted with any proposed signage meeting the requirements as noted in PD-160.

2. The proposed tree near the western entrance shall not negatively impact the existing street light.

**Public Comments**

The applicant, Ken Conaway, Omega CDC, Ken Conaway, LLC, 110 Harbour Drive, Springboro, OH, spoke in support of the proposal and answered questions from the Plan Board.
Kegan Sickels, President, Dayton View Triangle Federation, 1571 Burroughs Drive, Dayton, OH, said a brick color on the building that matches the Senior Lofts building under construction on the site and a metal panel color that leans toward gray is preferred.

**Board Discussion**
The Plan Board discussed the case including the need for window mullions, appropriate brick and panel colors, and whether the secondary parking lot can be removed later. As a result of this discussion, the Plan Board and applicant agreed to the following conditions:

1. Sign specifications shall be submitted with any proposed signage meeting the requirements as noted in PD-160.
2. The proposed tree near the western entrance shall not negatively impact the existing street light.
3. The small nine space parking lot shown on the site plan shall not connect to the center’s large parking lot. The small parking lot and its curb cut to Harvard Boulevard shall be removed entirely as later phases of the campus are developed.
4. The renderings shown to the Plan Board at the meeting are selected for the Hope Center’s building design. The brick color is to be a red that is compatible with the brick on the Omega Senior Lofts building. The building’s metal panels are to be a matte gray that is compatible with the campus’s existing chapel. Final colors for the brick and the metal panels shall be approved by Jeff Green and Tony Kroeger of the City of Dayton’s Planning Division prior to the materials being ordered. Windows on the building shall include a vertical, center mullion.

Plan Board members and Omega representatives also agreed that before initial design commences of any future building on the Omega Campus, Omega will meet with Planning Division staff about design parameters contained in PD-160. Omega will account for a Plan Board work session on the proposed building design in its building approval timeline.

**Board Action**
On March 10, 2020, the City Plan Board approved Case PLN2020-00049 (Development Plan for the Omega Hope Center) with conditions. A motion was made by Mr. Bradley, seconded by Ms. Pegues and carried to determine that those conditions were met and to approve the revised Development Plan for the Omega Hope Center (as submitted) with new conditions. The Plan Board found the revised Development Plan met the conditions of Planned Development PD-160 which governs Omega’s Harvard Campus and was also consistent with the City’s comprehensive plan, CitiPlan 20/20, the City of Dayton Zoning Code.

The conditions attached to the April 14, 2020 approval of the revised Development Plan are as follows:

1. Sign specifications shall be submitted with any proposed signage meeting the requirements as noted in PD-160.
2. The proposed tree near the western entrance shall not negatively impact the existing street light.
3. The small nine space parking lot shown on the site plan shall not connect to the center’s large parking lot. The small parking lot and its curb cut to Harvard Boulevard shall be removed entirely as later phases of the campus are developed.
4. The renderings as submitted on April 14 are selected for the Hope Center’s building design. The brick color is to be a red that is compatible with the brick on the Omega Senior Lofts building. The building’s metal panels are to be a matte gray that is compatible with the campus’s existing chapel. Final colors for the brick and the metal panels shall be approved by Jeff Green and Tony Kroeger of the City of Dayton’s Planning Division prior to the materials being ordered. Windows on the building shall include a vertical, center mullion.
Ms. Beverly Pendergast  Yes  Mr. Paul Bradley  Yes
Mr. Richard Wright  Absent  Mr. Matt Sauer  Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues  Yes  Mr. Greg Scott  Yes
Mr. Jeff Payne  Yes

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on May 12, 2020.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board