



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record February 11, 2020

1. PLN2020-00015 – Record Plan – Mendelsons

Applicant: Mr. David Marshall
The Kleingers Group
3040 Presidential Drive
Suite 202
Fairborn, OH 45324

Priority Land Use Board: Downtown Planning District: Webster Station

Decision: Approved with Conditions

Staff Comments

Abigail Free presented the staff report and recommended conditions. This replat is a consolidation of many lots and a vacated street into two lots along with dedication of public right-of-way.

Public Comments

None.

Board Discussion

None.

Board Action

A motion was made by Mr. Payne, seconded by Ms. Pegues and carried to approve Case PLN2020-00015 with the following conditions:

1. Revise the Record Plan and any Construction Drawings per the City of Dayton Subdivision Regulations and comments from the Division of Civil Engineering.
2. Ensure that the dimensions close to within a 1:10,000 ratio.
3. Add any easements required by DP&L, City of Dayton Water, etc.
4. Add the existing 30-ft, no-build easement around the McCormick building. It was established in 1998 to protect its window & door openings in the south and west walls.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Yes	Mr. Paul Bradley	Absent
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Absent
Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on March 10, 2020.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record February 11, 2020

2. PLN2019-00527 – Public Way Vacation: 16.5-ft Alley south of East Third Street (Cathcart Lane) from South Jefferson Street to South St Clair Street.

Applicant: Mr. David Neal
Windsor Fire Blocks
6600 Doubletree Avenue, Suite 8
Columbus, OH 43229

Priority Land Use Board: Downtown Planning District: Downtown

Decision: Tabled to March 10, 2020 Meeting

Staff Comments

Abigail Free presented the staff report and recommended conditions. She said that with the recommended conditions, staff believes the determinations and findings can be made as outlined in the staff report.

The Applicant is requesting to vacate Cathcart Lane to create a more cohesive, easier parking solution for the block that contains Price Store, St. Clair Lofts, Fire Blocks, St. Vincent Hotel, and Big Brothers Big Sisters. The alley vacation will give the property owners control over the parking lot and allow for the consolidation of parking functions. There will be a reconfiguration of the parking area which will result in approximately 164 total parking spaces. The site plan has also mapped out how private waste will be collected.

The Applicant has provided signed agreements from abutting property owners including Big Brothers Big Sisters, St. Clair Lofts, and 17 S St. Clair Street. Civil Engineering requests the petition to include all property owners for the block despite not directly touching the alley to be vacated.

The Applicant has submitted a parking plan for the block that incorporates 10-ft setbacks along street frontages and 5% interior landscaped islands, including two rain gardens. The setbacks are required to include street trees per City code and are shown on the submitted site plan. It is unclear if parking lot lighting will be updated, but lighting regulations are found within the zoning code. Also of note, the existing parking spaces along the south side of Big Brothers/Big Sisters will remain, but they were not included on the site plan.

Public Comments

The applicants, Aaron Weisman and David Neal, Windsor Companies, 6600 Doubletree Avenue, Suite 8, Columbus, OH, spoke in support of the proposal, described how the parking lot will be used, and answered questions from the Plan Board.

Board Discussion

The Plan Board discussed the case. Mr. Sauer asked why a vacation was necessary. Mr. Weisman said the aesthetics would not be added without the vacation. After discussion with the applicants as to what would be installed on the site and what would be removed, Plan Board members agreed that a complete and dimensioned site plan along with a detailed narrative was needed.

Board Action

A motion was made by Mr. Payne, seconded by Ms. Pegues and carried to table action on this case to the Plan Board’s March 10, 2020 meeting to allow time for the applicant to submit a complete and dimensioned site plan that included but was not limited to fencing, gates, entrances and exits, landscaping, parking lot layout, signage to be removed or added, and any structures to be removed (i.e., parking attendant’s building). A narrative that describes the site plan was also requested.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Yes	Mr. Paul Bradley	Absent
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Absent
Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on March 10, 2020.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record February 11, 2020

3. PLN2020-00005 – Establish a Two-Year Honorary Designation for a Portion of Midway Avenue between Malden and Whitmore Avenues for Lucinda Williams Adams

Applicant: Ms. Susan Hesselgesser
League of Women Voters
127 North Ludlow Street
Dayton, OH 45402

Priority Land Use Board: West Planning District: Residence Park
Decision: Recommended City Commission Approval

Staff Comments

Ken Marcellus presented the staff report and said staff believed the requirements of Resolution 5014-99 are met and recommended approval.

The League of Women Voters of the Greater Dayton Area is requesting that an honorary designation be established for a two block portion of Midway Avenue which runs alongside of the former residence of Mrs. Lucinda Williams Adams. The designation would be “Lucinda Williams Adams Way.” The official name of Midway Avenue would remain Midway Avenue.

Mrs. Lucinda Williams Adams, known as “Lady Dancer” because of her graceful style of running, was a 1960 Olympic Gold medal winner in the 4x100 meter relay and later in life was a well-respected physical education teacher and administrator in the Dayton Public School system.

In compliance with the requirements of Resolution 5014-99, sufficient support was received from property owners abutting the proposed designation. The City of Dayton Engineer, the Public Works Department, and the Police and Fire Departments have no objections to the designation. The West Priority Land Use Board, the Residence Park Neighborhood Association, and the Southwest Priority Board provided letters of support for the designation.

Public Comments

Pastor Herman Walker, Mt. Moriah Missionary Baptist Church, 301 Mia Avenue, Dayton, OH, which abuts the proposed honorary designation, spoke in support. He highlighted a few of Ms. Williams Adams’ accomplishments.

Board Discussion

None.

Board Action

A motion was made by Ms. Pegues, seconded by Mr. Payne and carried to recommend City Commission approval of the proposal (Case PLN2020-00005) to establish a two-year honorary designation for a portion of Midway Avenue between Malden and Whitmore Avenues for Lucinda Williams Adams Way. The official/legal name of Midway Avenue will remain

Midway Avenue. The Plan Board found the proposal consistent with the requirements found in City Commission Resolution 5014-99 as outlined in the staff report.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Yes	Mr. Paul Bradley	Absent
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Absent
Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on March 10, 2020

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record February 11, 2020

4. PLN2019-00631 – Zoning Map Amendment – A Planned Development application to establish a multi-family apartment complex in existing structures within a MR-5 zoning district. The buildings that would comprise the proposed Planned Development are 633 and 645 W. Grand Ave. as well as the adjacent vacant lots that face North Avenue and the structure currently standing at 702-704 North Ave.

Applicant: Mr. David Lemberg
Mountain Lion LLC
304 Franklin Street
Middletown, OH 45042

Priority Land Use Board: North Planning District: Grafton Hill
Central

Decision: Recommended City Commission Denial

Staff Comments

Jennifer Lumpkin presented the staff report. She said staff believed the determinations and findings could be made with the standards outlined in the Planned Development and recommended Plan Board support.

The zoning amendment will allow for the rehabilitation and re-establishment of occupancy of two multi-family dwellings on a .96-acre site. The current underlying zoning is MR-5 Mature Single-Family Residential. The structures at 633 and 645 W. Grand Ave. were built as multi-family dwellings in 1968. The site functioned intermittently as multi-family dwellings until 2015 when the owners at that time were found to be in violation of zoning regulations prohibiting the operation of a Hotel/Motel and were ordered to cease use and occupancy. Additional violations included the placement of a six-foot privacy fence without a Certificate of Appropriateness within a Historic District as well as several safety and fire violations. All residents were evicted, and the structures have sat vacant since that time. The site is comprised of five parcels and includes a third, smaller structure at 702-704 North Ave. that the owner does not intend to operate as a multi-family dwelling. Current plans include the demolition of the structure at 702-704 North Ave. to allow for additional off-street parking.

The applicant, Mountain Lion LLC, and Planning Staff have been working with the community to establish development standards that will ensure that the property and its use are consistent with the goals of the surrounding neighborhood. Among these standards are:

Unit Size and Density: The minimum square footage per unit shall be 575 sq. ft. The maximum density of all multi-family buildings shall be 56 units in total. The percentage of occupied units shall not exceed a number such that the ratio of off-street parking is less than 1.5 spaces per unit.

Setbacks: Setbacks shall be in accordance with the underlying MR-5 Mature Single Family Residential zoning. Grand Avenue and North Avenue shall both be treated as front

yard when determining setbacks. Parking areas along North Avenue shall have a minimum setback of five feet from existing sidewalk.

Landscaping, Fencing, & Screening: Existing street trees shall be maintained along Grand Avenue and North Avenue. Removal or replacement of street trees must comply with R.C.G.O. Section 150.800.6. The surface area between the existing multi-family buildings at 633 and 645 W. Grand Ave. shall be converted to landscaped community space with no vehicular access. Fencing along Grand Avenue shall not be placed in the front yard setback. Solid fencing shall not be permitted along North Avenue. Ornamental fencing, 7-foot maximum height, may be located along North Avenue and shall have a minimum setback of five feet. Gates may be permitted. Effective screening of the parking area must comply with R.C.G.O. Section 150.800.9 (B) to protect the privacy of the adjoining residential uses to the east and west.

Traffic and Pedestrian Access: Existing sidewalks shall be maintained and kept in good repair in perpetuity. Existing curb cuts and drive approaches shall be removed from Grand Avenue, including all of the drive area between the buildings on parcels R72 06606 0016 and 0044, and replaced with curb, sidewalk, and lawn. Vehicular access shall be limited to North Avenue.

Parking: A minimum ratio of 1.5 off-street parking spaces per unit is required. The Certificate of Occupancy shall limit the number of occupied units to maintain this ratio. Interior landscaped islands are not required. The required landscaped community space shall satisfy the landscaped island requirements. A minimum of 17 bicycle parking spaces for the off-street parking of bicycles shall comply with R.C.G.O. Section 150.700.13 and may include permanently anchored freestanding bicycle racks, enclosed bicycle lockers, and/or a fenced, covered, locked, or guarded bicycle storage area. In the event that an adjacent property is acquired by the applicant, a zoning map and text amendment application may be submitted for consideration by the Dayton Plan Board and City Commission.

Historic District Standards for Modifications: Approval by Landmark Commission shall be required for demolition of any structure. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be sought for exterior repairs and alterations to the property.

Exterior Lighting and Security Standards: Lighting for off-street parking shall comply with R.C.G.O. Section 150.700.14 (F) -Illumination. Security cameras shall be installed per submitted plans.

At its meeting on February 3, 2020, the North Central Priority Land Use Board recommended approval of the Planned Development with the condition that the property comply with the development standards put forth by Planning Staff, specifically the standards regarding a ratio of 1.5 off-street parking spaces per unit, landscaped community space, security, and compliance with City regulations in modifying structures located within a historic district.

Planning staff supports the proposed uses and development plan. The proposed development standards reflect the City's regulations as well as the expressed needs of the community. The rehabilitation of the property along with improvements to lighting and security will be a step forward in reducing blight in an otherwise dignified historic district.

Public Hearing Comments

The applicants, Kristine Bertrand and David Lemberg, Mountain Lion, 633 Grand Avenue, Dayton, OH spoke in support of the proposal, described their community outreach, plans for the property and answered questions from the Plan Board. They said they listened to community concerns regarding security and green space. Density was lowered. The smaller building on the site will serve as the complex's coffee room and contain a community room that can be booked for tenant events.

They are under contract to purchase the property next door to the east which contains a house (which is not part of the current Planned Development). The house will be kept and the property used for parking.

The renovations to the two large apartment buildings will be mainly interior work with new open plan kitchens, new bathrooms, vinyl flooring, roof repairs, new landscaping and parking lot repaving. Renovations will be completed floor by floor. The site will have ornamental fencing and electronic gates.

Julius Beckham, North Central Priority Land Use Board, 665 Ridgedale Road, Dayton, OH, said the Land Use Board saw this case three times. The major issue was parking. The majority of the neighborhood association went along with the plan as proposed. For the type of residents the apartments want to attract, it needs parking.

Eric Dye, Vice President, Grafton Hill Neighborhood Association, 308 Central Avenue, Dayton, OH, said they worked with the applicant and the city staff to address concerns and the standards contained in the proposed Planned Development are the result of this conversation. He said he was concerned about residents crossing Grand Avenue to get to their cars if they cannot park on-site. He asked that the case be tabled so the applicant has time to show how the requirements of the Planned Development will be met.

Dan Barton, Grafton Hill CDC, 308 Central Avenue, Dayton, OH, said he has lived in the neighborhood since 1988. He said the components of a successful project are not met. It precludes a high-market opportunity. He is not opposed to redevelopment, there just isn't enough land. He asked that the Plan Board table the case until the applicant reduces the number of units, finds more parking and addresses security.

Monica Snow, Preservation Dayton, Inc. 426 East Sixth Street, Dayton, OH, referenced the letter PDI submitted to the Plan Board on the case. She said this architectural intrusion should be torn down; there is no need to recycle a substandard apartment building. Build infill housing there instead.

Greg Humphrey, Grafton Hill Neighborhood Association Board, 322 Superior Avenue, Dayton, OH, said traffic on Grand Avenue is heavy and fast. If parking for the apartments is pushed onto the street, pedestrians crossing Grand Avenue are at risk.

Cheryl Bates, Grafton Hill CDC, 221 Belmonte Park East, Dayton, OH, referenced the handout the CDC distributed to the Plan Board. She said the application has been discussed for 3 months and this is the second or third version of the application. The written application has never caught up with what the applicants have said. The financials do not make sense. It is not a well thought out plan and she is not on favor of it as proposed. She asked that the case be tabled until a definite plan is presented.

Bill Marvin, President, Five Oaks Neighborhood Improvement Association (FONIA), 319 Rockwood Avenue, Dayton, OH, said this property has impacted Five Oaks seriously. It is one of the worst areas in the neighborhood for trash. The motel that operated at the site was abysmal. He'd love to see something responsible here. If the application can provide at least 1.5 parking spaces per unit then FONIA can support the proposal.

Board Discussion

The Plan Board discussed the case. Mr. Sauer said that the applicant doesn't have enough parking for 1.5 spaces per unit. He said that neighboring multi-family buildings have no parking or maybe .5 parking spaces per unit. He would love to see these buildings redeveloped. 1.5 parking spaces per unit could result in a sea of asphalt here. Mr. Payne and Ms. Pendergast said there are still issues that need to be addressed. Mr. Payne said if the applicants close on the property next door they can come back with a revised proposal. Also there are inconsistencies in the site plans; scaled plans are needed. Ms. Pegues said parking is an issue as is the number of units and whether the project will contain basement apartments.

Board Action

A motion was made by Mr. Payne, seconded by Ms. Pegues and carried to recommend City Commission disapproval of Case PLN2019-00631 based on the Plan Board's inability to make the determinations specified in R.C.G.O. Section 150.125.7.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	No	Mr. Paul Bradley	Absent
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Matt Sauer	No
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Absent
Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on March 10, 2020.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record

February 11, 2020

5. PLN2020-00016 – General Development Plan Amendment – 2020 Amendment to the Grandview Medical Center General Development Plan

Applicant: Mr. Michael Taylor
Pinnacle Architects
480 Vantage Point, Suite 201
Miamisburg, OH 45342

Priority Land Use Board: North Planning District: Five Oaks
Central

Decision: Approved with Conditions

Staff Comments

Abigail Free presented the staff report. This case is an update to the Grandview Medical Center General Development Plan to permit the construction of a new 77 space off street parking lot, as well as other parking lot and emergency drive improvements constructed from 2017 through 2019. She recommended Plan Board approval of the proposed changes to the General Development Plan with the following condition: Remove and/or replace chain link fencing and barbed wire in conjunction with existing parking lots.

Grandview's General Development Plan was first reviewed in 2009 and referenced a two phase redevelopment of the campus with a main focus on a new 4-story west wing addition and the removal of the existing maternity building. A temporary helipad, parking, and entry improvements were also proposed in Phase 1. Phase 2 references redevelopment of the east side of Forest Avenue with parking, a large addition, and new structures. Ultimately, the Plan Board approved only Phase 1 of their plan with conditions including the removal of the helipad. Phase 2 required separate approval at a later date. In 2009, parking totaled 892 spaces. All 2009 redevelopment projects have been completed.

In 2016, Grandview submitted an updated General Development Plan for review of a proposed helipad within the parking lot on the land east of Forest Avenue. A permanent helipad was a requirement to become a Level 3 Trauma Center. The proposed location and flight paths were reviewed in 2016. The helipad would reduce the existing parking area by 57 spaces and be secured by a vinyl coated chain link fence. Also, the 2016 plan noted two future off-street parking lots adding a total of 81 spaces, if necessary.

The proposed helipad and location became a source of contention with the surrounding residents. Grandview Medical Center postponed the case to do more community outreach and ultimately never brought the 2016 plan update to the City Plan Board for review.

Since 2016, Grandview has done a lot of improvements to the interior of the hospital and also redeveloped existing and new off-street parking lots. They have also applied to vacate the remaining portion of Shaw Avenue from their existing employee parking lot on the east side of Forest Avenue to Great Miami Blvd. During the review of the proposed vacation, a proposed new parking lot for the vacated area was discussed. Staff noted that the parking lot was not on an

approved General Development Plan. This led the Plan Board to continue the vacation case until an updated plan was approved.

Grandview Medical Center submitted a 2020 update to their General Development Plan for review. This update is essentially the Phase 2 from 2009. The plan notes seven projects that have been completed or to be completed in the near future. A development summary and plan show the updates. They are as follows:

1. 2017 – Addition to the Emergency Trauma Center and EMS driveway link to Neal Avenue
2. 2017 – East parking lot expansion along Grand Avenue adjacent to 300 Forest Avenue (56 new spaces)
3. 2018 – East parking lot expansion along Grand Avenue and detention basin.
4. 2018 – Campus parking lot expansion along the hospital, west entry drive on Shaw Avenue (28 new spaces)
5. 2019 – Improvements to 300 Forest Avenue including ADA elevator
6. 2020 – Concrete slab (6,000-sf) for new air handler for Trauma Center
7. 2020 – East parking lot expansion, vacation of Shaw Avenue (77 new spaces)

Overall, site redevelopment is primarily to increase parking for the campus. After the closing of Good Samaritan Hospital, Grandview Medical Center added new beds due to an increase of patients. The parking will total 1074 spaces once all parking expansions are complete. The proposed site plan will allow for the entrance to the parking at Shaw Avenue to provide required setbacks and landscaping to improve the aesthetic of the Great Miami Blvd corridor just off of I-75.

Public Comments

The North Central Priority Land Use Board met on the case and voted unanimously to approve the amendment request.

The applicant, Michael Taylor, Pinnacle Architects, 480 Vantage Point, Suite 201, Miamisburg, OH, spoke in support of the case, described the proposal, and answered questions from the Plan Board. He said the overall goal is to reduce on-street parking demands by providing more off-street parking.

Bill Marvin, President, Five Oaks Neighborhood Improvement Association (FONIA), 319 Rockwood Avenue, Dayton, OH, said Grandview is a really good partner. He said there is a rumor that the concrete slab for air handling on Neal Avenue is really for a helipad.

George Stamaty, 841 Belmonte Park North, Dayton, OH, said the first mailed notification to property owners included a helipad as part of the proposal. Why is there a 6,000 sq. ft. pad in the plan? Staff said the applicant withdrew the helipad from the proposal and staff mailed out a revised notice stating such; this case does not include a helipad.

Board Discussion

The Plan Board discussed the case. Mr. Sauer said it is a shame that there is so much on-street parking at the gateway. Mr. Payne asked if a parking structure is in the future and cautioned against buying more property for more parking.

Board Action

A motion was made by Ms. Pegues, seconded by Ms. Pendergast and carried to approve, with one condition, the 2020 amended General Development Plan for Grandview Medical Center as submitted based on the Board's ability to make the necessary determinations found in R.C.G.O. §150.335.12 (C)(2)(b). The condition is:

1. Remove and/or replace chain link fencing and barbed wire in conjunction with existing parking lots.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Yes	Mr. Paul Bradley	Absent
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Absent
Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on March 10, 2020.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record February 11, 2020

6. Re: PLN2019-00647 – Public Way Vacation: Shaw Avenue from Great Miami Boulevard to the east property line of City Lot #13986.

Applicant: Mr. Ray Theis

Grandview Medical Center

405 West Grand Avenue

Dayton, OH 45405

Priority Land Use Board: North

Planning District: Riverdale

Central

Decision: Established Conditions

Staff Comments

Abigail Free presented the staff report. She said that with the recommended conditions, staff believes the determinations and findings can be made and recommended Plan Board support.

This request to vacate Shaw Avenue from Great Miami Boulevard to the east property line of City Lot #13986 is related to the redevelopment of Shaw Avenue as parking for Grandview Medical Center. The existing street dead ends into the hospital and parking lots. The property abutting the street is all owned by the hospital. Demolition of dwellings and commercial structures has taken place recently, so no other uses will be affected by the vacation. Grandview Medical Center's 2020 General Development Plan, approved by the Plan Board in the previous case, shows recent parking lot updates.

Public Comments

None.

Board Discussion

None.

Board Action

A motion was made by Ms. Pendergast, seconded by Ms. Pegues and carried to find the proposed vacation (Case PLN-2019-00647) met the criteria cited in R.C.G.O. Section 150.445(B). The Plan Board therefore established the following conditions:

1. The area shall be marked in a manner acceptable to the Division of Civil Engineering to indicate that it is not public right-of-way.
2. The street opening at W Great Miami Boulevard shall be removed and replaced with curb and walk, or a driveway shall be constructed. All work shall be completed within 90 days of the date the vacation receives final approval and to City of Dayton standards.
3. The applicant shall contact Miami Valley Lighting to remove the City of Dayton from billing for the street light on Shaw Avenue.
4. Establish easements for the existing water utilities:
 - 6-inch water main

- 8-inch sanitary sewer
- 12-inch storm sewer

The easement boundaries shall be 10-feet north of the water main and 10-feet south of the sanitary sewer. Also, a 20-foot easement is required for the 12-inch storm sewer, with the pipe centered in the easement.

5. Establish a 10-ft easement DP&L’s existing aerial facilities that run along Shaw Avenue.
6. Establish an easement for Vectren’s 2-inch plastic medium pressure main within Shaw Avenue.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Yes	Mr. Paul Bradley	Absent
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Absent
Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on March 10, 2020.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record

February 11, 2020

7. PLN2020-00019 – Work Session: Draft Northwest Dayton Neighborhoods Vision Plan

Applicant: Mr. Todd Kinskey, Director

City of Dayton

Department of Planning and Community Development

101 West Third Street

Dayton, OH 45402

Priority Land Use Board: North

Planning District: Various

Central

Decision: Postponed to March 10, 2020 Meeting

This case was postponed to the March 10, 2020 meeting.

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on March 10, 2020.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board